

**Department of Health and Human Services
Division of Human Resources**

Analysis of DHHS Difficult-to-Recruit Job Classifications

January 31, 2008

DHHS applicant profile

- 19,252 permanent and permanent part-time positions
- ~95,000 applications received annually
- ~70% of applicants are qualified or highly qualified
- A job posting attracts an average of 36 applicants, ~25 of which are qualified or highly qualified

Difficult-to-recruit classifications

Difficult-to-Recruit: Average 10 or less qualified/highly qualified applicants per job posting

DHHS uses 1400 job classifications

38 DHHS job classifications are very difficult-to-recruit

- 39% allied health (i.e., speech/language pathologist, physical therapist)
- 29% Medical/Nursing (i.e., pharmacist, physician/psychiatrist, registered nurse)
- 20% Human Services (i.e., clinical social worker, rehabilitation counselor)
- 4.8% Architecture/Engineering (i.e., facility architect, building systems engineer)
- 4.8% Educator (i.e., teacher, principal)
- 2.4% IT (i.e., business/technology applications analyst)

245 DHHS job classifications have been designated as eligible for continuous recruitment which means these classes have experienced past or recurring recruitment problems - - the 38 difficult to recruit classes are included in this total.

The vacancy rate for all classes is 8.25% compared to 11% (simple average) for difficult-to-recruit classes.

DHHS averages ~14% total turnover per year, generating potentially 2600 vacancies; however, there were 4278 job postings in 2007 meaning 64% of jobs had to be reposted more than once, typically due to an insufficient applicant pool or dissatisfaction with the applicant pool.

The 38 difficult-to-recruit classifications make up less than 3% of DHHS classes, but account conservatively for 20% of the job postings since difficult to recruit jobs often require reposting.

Top 10 reasons applicants are attracted to public service

Source: Corporate Leadership Council

1. Compensation (i.e., base pay and other financial offerings, e.g., 401K match)
2. Work-life balance (i.e., the extent the job allows the employee to balance work and other interests)
3. Organization stability (i.e., job security and reputation for stability)
4. Future career opportunities
5. Respect (i.e., the respect the organization shows employees)
6. Job-interests alignment (i.e., match of personal interest to the job)
7. Location
8. Health benefits
9. Development opportunities (i.e., training offered in the job or by the organization)
10. Retirement benefits

Top reasons employees are attracted to NC government

Top 6 reasons employees are attracted to NC State Government

Source: OSP 2007 focus groups (Note: Compensation and job interests were rated higher while the remaining values were rated equally among the focus groups: N=100)

1. Compensation
2. Job-interests alignment
3. Health benefits
4. Work-life balance
5. Location
6. Retirement benefits

Top reasons for DHHS attraction and separation

33% of applicants declined a DHHS difficult-to-recruit job due to salary. 52% of applicants preferred not to report by answering “other” or “personal.” Source: HHS Human Resources’ Applicant Tracking System (N=40)

Top 4 reasons DHHS employees leave DHHS

Source: HHS Human Resources’ Applicant Tracking System (N=701)

1. Compensation (16%)
2. Future career opportunities (13%)
3. Working conditions (10%)
4. Non-specified/preferred not to report (10%)

Note: The Corporate Leadership Council survey does not list “Compensation” as one of the top 10 reasons for separation in industry and government surveys which infers a troubling trend for DHHS.

Barriers to attracting applicants

1. State salary administration policies (i.e., 5% per year of experience over the minimum requirement of the job class limits the ability to negotiate salary, particularly in high demand markets such as psychiatrists and nursing)
2. Experience requirement for professional non-career banded jobs (i.e., state classifications normally require a year or two of experience to meet minimum qualifications whereas private industry has the ability to hire for entry-level professional jobs right out of college)
3. Equity (i.e., hiring officials are appropriately sensitive to the pay of career employees and therefore may limit salary offers based on the average salary of employees)
4. Funding (i.e., the absence of funding in a vacant position at midpoint or higher or no salary reserves limits hiring officials ability to pay what the market demands)
5. No hiring incentives (i.e., sign-on bonuses for such occupations as RNs and Physicians are commonly used in private industry)
6. 54% of county governments in NC contribute to employees' 401K.
7. 50% of southeastern states contribute to employees' 401K.
8. DHHS has no line item allocated to marketing and recruitment.

Temporary employees in DHHS permanent and permanent part-time positions

1. Temporary employees hired into DHHS positions are subject to the state's salary administration and qualification guidelines, so qualification and pay is not appreciably different than permanent employees.
2. Temporary employees are paid hourly; therefore, jobs normally designated as FLSA exempt are subject to federal wage and hour overtime provisions with exception to jobs such as physicians and lawyers - - this also applies to individuals hired via personal service contract when an employee-employer relationship exists.
3. State personnel policy limits the number of months a temporary employee (20 hours or more per week for 12 months max) may work, therefore increasing indirect costs for loss productivity and replacement- - the US Department of Labor estimates the cost at 1/3 of the annualized salary for the replacement of an employee which may range up to 150% by some estimates.
4. 47% (406 of 857) of temporary employees are retired meaning their salaries may be equal to or above that of the average co-worker with an average state service of 10 years.
5. 21% (85 of 405) of permanent part-time employees are retired meaning their salaries are equal to or above that of the average co-worker with an average state service of 10 years (i.e., DHHS average pay is \$39,900 compared to \$44,226 average pay for retired permanent part-time employees).
6. For #4 and #5 above, the replacement of retired temporary and retired permanent part-time employees with applicants entering the workforce is less expensive when considering that new employees are normally paid in the first quartile of the salary range while retired employees generally make in the third quartile or higher of the salary range.
7. Retired temporary and retired permanent part-time employees provide continuity in service delivery, particularly in very specialized work areas or programs that have high attrition rates.

Market comparison to difficult-to-recruit classes

(See “Comments” column on the attachment as reference for the data below.)

1. DHHS HR had insufficient market data on 11 of 38, or 33%, of the difficult-to-recruit job classes.
2. 13 of 27, or 48%, average pay of employees is -5% or more below the market average pay.
3. 4 of 27, or 15%, average pay of employees is +5% or more above the market average pay.
4. 16 of 38, or 42%, of the classes have total turnover at or above the DHHS turnover average of 14%.
5. 23 of 38, or 60%, of the classes have a vacancy rate that exceeds the DHHS vacancy rate of 8.25%.
6. 31 of 38, or 81%, of the classes have had range revisions since 2001 due to market, turnover and/or recruitment.
7. 24 of 36 classes (not including educators), or 67%, are funded on average less than the midpoint of the salary range.

ANALYSIS OF DIFFICULT TO RECRUIT JOB CLASSIFICATIONS

CY 2007

JOB CLASS	# Job Postings	# Qualified-Highly Qualified Applicants	Qualified/ Highly Qualified Apps Per Posting	Avg. Salary Compared to Market	CY 2007 Total Turnover	Vacancy Rate****	Comments
Audiologist	0	0	0	-14%	0%	0%	2,6,7
Behavioral Programming Tech	13	30	2.3	***imd	44%	33%	1,4,5,7
Building Systems Engineer II	13	116	8.9	imd	6%	19%	1,5,6,7
Bus & Tech App Analyst	74	692	9.3	imd	13%	17%	1,5
Clinical Dietician I	5	14	2.8	-2%	18%	0%	4,6
Clinical Pharmacist	15	40	2.6	12%	11%	3%	3,6
Clinical Social Worker	73	177	2.4	8%	23%	11%	3,4,5,6,7
Cytotechnologist	3	17	5.6	-19%	10%	0%	2,6,7
Deaf/Blind Intervenor	0	0	0	imd	0%	0%	1,7
Facility Architect II	13	33	2.5	12%	8%	25%	3,5,6,7
Human Services Planner/Evaluator III	25	196	7.8	imd	14%	17%	1,4,5
Interpreter for the Deaf II	12	56	4.6	imd	25%	17%	1,4,5,6
Licensed Practical Nurse	37	217	5.8	7%	18%	5%	3,4,6,7
Mental Retardation Hab Coord II	30	135	4.5	-7%	12%	3%	2,6,7
Nurse RN Lead	71	445	6.2	-2%	23%	4%	4,6,7
Nurse Supervisor I	11	28	2.5	imd	17%	0%	1,4,6
Nursing Eye Care Consultant	3	5	1.6	imd	14%	12%	1,4,5,6,7
Occupational Therapist I	45	58	1.2	-4%	13%	20%	5,6,7
Occupational Therapy Asst II	6	6	1	-14%	0%	0%	2,6
Pharmacist	0	0	0	-4%	0%	0%	6
Physical Therapist II*	14	14	1	-7%	3%	6%	2,6,7
Physical Therapy Asst I	2	5	2.5	-13%	11%	0%	2,6
Physician Extender II	8	19	2.3	-4%	23%	14%	4,5,6,7
Physician III - A	12	28	2.3	-7%	9%	5%	2,6,7
Physician III - B	9	14	1.5	0%	11%	16%	5,6,7
Pub Health Disease Ctrl Spec I	11	7	0.6	-7%	18%	26%	2,4,5,6,7
Pub Health Epidemiologist II	0	0	0	imd	0%	25%	1,5,6
Public Health Nurse Consultant II	20	194	9.7	imd	13%	15%	1,5,6,7
Registered Nurse B	24	218	9	-2%	19%	14%	4,5,6,7

ANALYSIS OF DIFFICULT TO RECRUIT JOB CLASSIFICATIONS

CY 2007

JOB CLASS	# Job Postings	# Qualified-Highly Qualified Applicants	Qualified/Highly Qualified Apps Per Posting	Avg. Salary Compared to Market	CY 2007 Total Turnover	Vacancy Rate****	Comments
Rehab Counselor I	129	811	6.2	-11%	21%	10%	2,4,5,6,7
School Educator I (Teacher 115C)	3	11	3.6	*	8%	11%	5
School Guidance Counselor (115C)	1	0	0	*	0%	25%	5
Senior Psychologist I	17	48	2.8	-9%	4%	11%	2,5,6,7
Speech & Lang Path I	71	139	1.9	-9%	26%	19%	2,4,5,6
Staff Psychologist II	45	87	1.9	<i>imd</i>	18%	9%	1,4,5,6,7
Substance Abuse Counselor II	13	102	7.8	-9%	11%	18%	2,5,7
Therapeutic Recreation Spec I	29	73	2.5	-4%	17%	11%	4,5,6,7
Radiologic Technologist	4	6	1.5	-9%	0%	0%	2,6
	861	4041	4.6				
*Pay determined by DPI pay plan with county supplements limited to 8% for DHHS compared to LEA's who can offer above this rate							
**Market and Turnover Displayed For Physical Therapist I							
*** <i>imd</i> = insufficient market data							