

# Prioritization 3.0/Strategic Transportation Investments 

## BOT Approved Highway Quantitative Scoring Criteria

September 10, 2013


## How the STI Works

| 40\% of Funds = \$6B | 30\% of Funds $=\$ 4.5 \mathrm{~B}$ | $30 \%$ of Funds $=\$ 4.58$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Statewide Mobility | Estimated \$15B in Funds for SFY 2016-2025 |  |
| Focus $\rightarrow$ Address Significant Congestion and Bottlenecks Eligible Projects | Regional Impact |  |
| - Statewide-type projects (such as Interstates) <br> - Selection based on $100 \%$ data | Focus $\rightarrow$ Improve Connectivity within Regions Eligible Projects | Division Needs |
| - Projects programmed prior to local input ranking | - Projects not selected in Statewide Mobility category <br> - Regional projects <br> - Selection based on 70\% data \& 30\% local input | Focus $\rightarrow$ Address Local Needs <br> Eligible Projects <br> - Projects not selected in Statewide or Regional categories <br> - Division projects |
|  | - Funding based on population within region | - Selection based on $50 \%$ data \& 50\% ocal input <br> - Funding based on equal share for each Division $=\sim \$ 34 \mathrm{M}$ per year 2 |



## Eligibility Definitions - Highways

|  | Statewide | Regional | Division |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Highway | - Interstates and Future Interstates <br> - Routes on the NHS as of July 1, 2012 <br> - Routes on Department of Defense Strategic Highway Network (STRAHNET) <br> - Appalachian Development Highway System Routes <br> - Uncompleted Intrastate projects <br> - Designated Toll Facilities | - Other US and NC Routes | - All SR Routes |



## Eligibility Definitions - Highways

## Types of Highway Trust Fund eligible projects evaluated in P3.0:

- Widening
- New Location
- Upgrade Roadway
- Intersection/Interchange
- Intelligent Transportation System (such as Signal System)
- Modernization (increasing lane and/or shoulder width)



## Highway Project Scoring Overview

| Statewide Mobility |  | Regional Impact | Division Needs |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Eligible <br> Projects: | - Statewide | - Statewide <br> - Regional | - Statewide <br> - Regional <br> - Division |



## Highway Scoring - Eligible Quantitative Criteria

Criteria

- Congestion (Volume/Capacity Ratio + AADT)
- Benefit/Cost (Travel Time Savings/Project Cost)
- Safety Score (Critical Crash Rates, Density, Severity)
- Pavement Score (Pavement Condition Rating)
- Lane Width (Existing Width vs. Standard Width)
- Shoulder Width (Existing Width vs. Standard Width)
- Multimodal (Military, Transportation Terminals \& Trucks)
- Economic Competitiveness (Jobs + Value Added in \$)
- Accessibility/Connectivity (TBD)

Note: Freight criteria is accounted for in the Multimodal criteria.

Existing Conditions

Project Benefits (Future Conditions)


## BOT Approved Highway Scoring Criteria and Weights

## Funding Category

QUANTITATIVE Data

## LOCAL INPUT Division Rank MPO/RPO Rank

[Travel Time] Benefit/Cost = 30\%
Congestion = 30\%
Statewide Mobility

Economic Competitiveness = 10\%
Safety $=10 \%$
Multimodal [\& Freight + Military] = 20\%
Total = 100\%
[Travel Time] Benefit/Cost = 30\%
Regional Impact

Congestion = 30\%
Safety $=10 \%$
15\%
15\%
Total = 70\%
[Travel Time] Benefit/Cost = 20\%

| Division | Congestion $=20 \%$ | 25 | $25 \%$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

Total = 50\%

Note: Div. 1, 2, 3, \& 4 have agreed to use different criteria for Regional Impact and Division Needs projects. 7


## HIGHWAY Scoring

## All projects scored on 0-100 point scale

For projects on new location, existing data comes from a "parallel route"

- Parallel Route defined as the roadway(s) motorists currently use to travel between the beginning and end of the project

All quantitative scores will be calculated automatically by application (SPOT On!ine) - user will be able to see preliminary scores shortly after project entry


## Example Projects (Completed or Under Construction)

| TIP | Route | To | Description | County | Div | Eligibility |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| R-2248E | I-485 | NC 115 | Construct Freeway <br> on New Location | Mecklenb <br> urg | 10 | Statewide |  |
| I-4744 (Wade | I-40 | I-440/US 1/64 | Widen Roadway | Wake | 5 | Statewide |  |
| R-2554BA | US 70 (Goldsboro <br> Bypass) | East of SR 1300 <br> (Salem Church Rd) | East of SR 1556 <br> (Wayne Memorial Dr) | Construct Freeway <br> on New Location | Wayne | 4 | Statewide |
| R-4463B | NC 43 Connector | US 70 | NC 43/55 | Construct Roadway <br> on New Location | Craven | 2 | Regional |
| R-2911B | US 70 | Iredell County Line | SR 1001 (Old Amity <br> Hill Road) | Widen Roadway | Rowan | 9 | Regional |
| R-2519A | US 19E | East of SR 1336 <br> (Jacks Creek Rd) | NC 80 | Widen Roadway | Yancey | 13 | Regional |
| U-3810 | SR 1406 (Piney <br> Green Rd) | NC 24 | US 17 | Widen Roadway | Onslow | 3 | Division |
| U-4909 | SR 2643 (Union <br> Cross Rd) | SR 2691 (Wallburg <br> Rd) | SR 2632 (Sedge <br> Garden Rd) | Widen Roadway | Forsyth | 9 | Division |
| R-3833A | SR 1100 (Brawley <br> School Rd) | SR 1177 <br> (Chuckwood Rd) | US 21 | Widen Roadway | Iredell | 12 | Division |



## HIGHWAY - Congestion

## Funding Category <br> Criteria Weight <br> Statewide Mobility <br> 30\% <br> Regional Impact <br> 30\% <br> Division Needs <br> 20\% <br> Purpose - Measure existing level of mobility along roadways by indicating congested locations and bottlenecks

## ((Existing Vol./Capacity Ratio x 100) x 60\%) + ((Existing Vol./1,000) x 40\%)

Note: The use of Travel Time Index, which is a comparison of actual congested speeds from GPS devices to ideal travel speed, is continuing to be investigated for use in P3.0. Based on input from NCDOT's traffic engineers, this measure may replace the use of Volume/Capacity ratio in the above equation.


## Example Projects - Congestion Score

| TIP | Project | Existing Volume | Existing Capacity | Volume / Capacity Ratio | Congestion Score |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| R-2248E | 1-485 New Location | 117,000 | 140,000 | 0.84 | 90.40 |
| 1-4744 | 1-40 Widening | 94,000 | 70,000 | 1.34 | 97.60 |
| R-2554BA | US 70 (Goldsboro Bypass) | 31,000 | 60,000 | 0.52 | 43.60 |
| R-4463B | NC 43 Connector | 24,000 | 40,000 | 0.60 | 45.60 |
| R-2911B | US 70 Widening | 9,000 | 16,000 | 0.56 | 37.20 |
| R-2519A | US 19E Widening | 14,000 | 16,000 | 0.88 | 58.40 |
| U-3810 | SR 1406 (Piney Green Rd) Widening | 20,000 | 16,000 | 1.25 | 68.00 |
| U-4909 | SR 2643 (Union Cross Rd) Widening | 16,000 | 16,000 | 1.00 | 66.40 |
| R-3833A | SR 1100 (Brawley School Rd) Widening | 18,000 | 16,000 | 1.13 | 67.20 |



## HIGHWAY - [Travel Time] Benefit-Cost

## Funding Category <br> Statewide Mobility <br> Criteria Weight <br> Regional Impact 30\% <br> Division Needs <br> Purpose - Measure the expected travel time savings benefits of the project over a 30-year period against the estimated project cost to NCDOT

## Travel Time Savings over 30 years in \$/Project Cost to NCDOT

- Travel Time Savings calculated using comparison if project was implemented today then multiplied by 30 years
- Project cost consists of construction, right of way, and utilities costs
- Cost can be lowered if other funds are committed to project by locals

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Example Projects - [Travel Time] Beneftrcost Score |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| TIP | Project | Travel Time Savings over 30 years (\$) | Project Cost | Other Funding | Cost to NCDOT | Benefit/Cost Score |
| R-2248E | I-485 New Location | \$4,859,808,000 | \$206,836,000 | \$0 | \$206,836,000 | 23.50 |
| 1-4744 | I-40 Widening | \$3,502,916,000 | \$59,910,000 | \$0 | \$59,910,000 | 58.47 |
| R-2554BA | US 70 (Goldsboro Bypass) | \$2,060,655,000* | \$335,731,000* | \$0 | \$335,731,000* | 6.14 |
| R-4463B | NC 43 Connector | \$963,071,000* | \$67,415,000* | \$0 | \$67,415,000* | 14.29 |
| R-2911B | US 70 Widening | \$108,246,000 | \$23,544,000 | \$0 | \$23,544,000 | 4.60 |
| R-2519A | US 19E Widening | \$457,696,000 | \$72,288,000 | \$0 | \$72,288,000 | 6.33 |
| U-3810 | SR 1406 (Piney Green Rd) Widening | \$219,185,000 | \$97,235,000 | \$0 | \$97,235,000 | 2.25 |
| U-4909 | SR 2643 (Union Cross Rd) Widening | \$81,080,000 | \$90,308,000 | \$0 | \$90,308,000 | 0.90 |
| R-3833A | SR 1100 (Brawley School Rd) Widening | \$106,009,000 | \$64,347,000 | \$0 | \$64,347,000 | 1.65 |

## Example Projects - [Travel Time] Benefit-Cost Score

*Full benefits of the project are not realized until entire new location roadway is complete. Travel Time Savings and Cost values are based on the entire project.


## HIGHWAY - Safety

Funding Category
Statewide Mobility
Regional Impact
Division Needs

## Criteria Weight

$$
10 \%
$$

$$
10 \%
$$

10\%

Purpose - Measure existing safety conditions along / at the project

## Segments $\rightarrow$ (Crash Density x 33\%) + (Severity Index x 33\%) + (Critical Crash Rate x 33\%)

Intersections $\rightarrow$ (Crash Frequency x 50\%) + (Severity Index x 50\%)

- All data provided by Mobility \& Safety Division (3-year moving average)
- Higher scores indicate poorer conditions



## Example Projects - Safety Score

| TIP | Crash <br> Density | Severity <br> Index |  | Critical Crash <br> Rate | Safety <br> Score |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| R-2248E | I-485 New Location | 78.80 | 61.60 | 71.70 | $\mathbf{7 0 . 6 9}$ |
| I-4744 | I-40 Widening | 87.20 | 48.70 | 87.20 | $\mathbf{7 4 . 3 6}$ |
| R-2554BA | US 70 (Goldsboro Bypass) | 71.10 | 67.70 | 61.40 | 66.73 |
| R-4463B | NC 43 Connector | 73.10 | 56.90 | 48.80 | 59.59 |
| R-2911B | US 70 Widening | 91.50 | 91.50 | 33.80 | $\mathbf{7 2 . 2 6}$ |
| R-2519A | US 19E Widening | 58.80 | 62.70 | 23.50 | $\mathbf{4 8 . 3 3}$ |
| U-3810 | SR 1406 (Piney Green Rd) <br> Widening | 97.50 | 67.40 | 74.90 | $\mathbf{7 9 . 9 3}$ |
| U-4909 | SR 2643 (Union Cross Rd) <br> Widening | 100.00 | 81.50 | 48.10 | $\mathbf{7 6 . 5 3}$ |
| R-3833A | SR 1100 (Brawley School <br> Rd) Widening | 100.00 | 59.30 | 55.60 | $\mathbf{7 1 . 6 3}$ |



## HIGHWAY - Multimodal [\& Freight + Military]

## Funding Category

Statewide Mobility
Regional Impact
Division Needs

## Criteria Weight

$$
20 \%
$$

--
--
Purpose - Measure existing congestion along key military and truck routes, and routes that provide connections to transportation terminals

25\% - Volume/Capacity Ratio on projects on Non-Interstate STRAHNET Routes
$25 \%$ - Volume/Capacity Ratio on projects on routes that provide direct connection (property line) to a transportation terminal along a roadway with an access point (airport, seaport, rail depot, ferry terminal, transit terminal, major military base, and freight intermodal terminal - includes air/truck/rail/pipeline terminals)
50\% - Truck Volumes / 100
(V/C Ratio [Non-Interstate STRAHNET] x 25\%) + (V/C Ratio [Route connecting to Transportation Terminal] x 25\%) + (Truck Volumes / $100 \times 50 \%$ )


## Example Projects - Multimodal [\& Freight + Military] Score

| TIP | Project | Volume / <br> Capacity Ratio <br> Interstate <br> STRAHNET <br> Route? | Non- <br> Connection to <br> Trans. <br> Terminal? | Truck <br> Volume |  <br> Freight + Military] <br> Score |  |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| R-2248E | I-485 New Location | 0.84 | No | No | 12,900 | $\mathbf{5 0 . 0 0}$ |
| I-4744 | I-40 Widening | 1.34 | No | No | 10,300 | 50.00 |
| R-2554BA | US 70 (Goldsboro <br> Bypass) | 0.52 | Yes | No | 3,100 | $\mathbf{2 8 . 5 0}$ |
| R-4463B | NC 43 Connector | 0.60 | No | No | 2,300 | $\mathbf{1 1 . 5 0}$ |
| R-2911B | US 70 Widening | 0.56 | No | No | 1,100 | $\mathbf{5 . 5 0}$ |
| R-2519A | US 19E Widening | 0.88 | No | No | 1,400 | $\mathbf{7 . 0 0}$ |
| U-3810 | SR 1406 (Piney Green <br> Rd) Widening | 1.25 | No | Yes | 600 | $\mathbf{2 8 . 0 0}$ |
| U-4909 | SR 2643 (Union Cross <br> Rd) Widening | 1.00 | No | No | 500 | $\mathbf{2 . 5 0}$ |
| R-3833A | SR 1100 (Brawley <br> School Rd) Widening | 1.13 | No | No | 500 | $\mathbf{2 . 5 0}$ |



## HIGHWAY - Economic Competitiveness

Funding Category
Statewide Mobility
Regional Impact
Division Needs

## Criteria Weight

$$
10 \%
$$

N/A
N/A

Purpose - Measure the economic benefits the transportation project is expected to provide in economic activity (GDP) and jobs over 30 years

## Score based on Output from TRED\#S ${ }^{\circ}$ (Economic Impact Model)

- Primary inputs are Travel Time Savings, Location, and Freight Traffic
- Output is \# of long-term jobs created (50\%) + Value added in \$ (50\%) based on \% change in NCDOT Division Economy
- Includes wages increased, increased productivity
- Accounts for current economic conditions (includes use of labor statistics)
- Results based on 30-year forecast using Moody's Analytics data
- Does NOT include contingent development
- Criteria is not intended to evaluate projects for recruiting purposes



## Example Projects - Economic Competitiveness Score

| TIP | Project | Travel Time Savings (per yr) | Div | Long-term Employment | \% Change in Economic Value Added | Economic Competitiveness Score |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| R-2248E | I-485 New Location | 7,040,533 | 10 | 1,641 | 0.1072\% | 100.00 |
| 1-4744 | I-40 Widening | 5,074,767 | 5 | 1,278 | 0.0959\% | 97.93 |
| R-2554BA | US 70 (Goldsboro Bypass) | 2,995,867 | 4 | 971 | 0.2348\% | 98.55 |
| R-4463B | NC 43 Connector | Criteria Not Applicable |  |  |  |  |
| R-2911B | US 70 Widening | Criteria Not Applicable |  |  |  |  |
| R-2519A | US 19E Widening | Criteria Not Applicable |  |  |  |  |
| U-3810 | SR 1406 (Piney Green Rd) Widening | Criteria Not Applicable |  |  |  |  |
| U-4909 | SR 2643 (Union Cross Rd) Widening | Criteria Not Applicable |  |  |  |  |
| R-3833A | SR 1100 (Brawley School Rd) Widening | Criteria Not Applicable |  |  |  |  |



## HIGHWAY - Pavement Condition

Funding Category
Statewide Mobility
Regional Impact
Division Needs

## Criteria Weight

Purpose - Measure the existing pavement condition along the project

## 100 - Pavement Condition Rating

- Based on 2012 Pavement Condition Survey
- Higher scores indicate poorer pavement condition



## HIGHWAY - Lane Width

Funding Category
Statewide Mobility
Regional Impact
Division Needs

## Criteria Weight

Purpose - Measure the existing lane width vs. DOT design standard

## Existing Lane Width - DOT Design Standard Lane Width

- Greater the difference, the higher points the project receives
- 1 foot difference = 25 points
- 2 foot difference $=50$ points
- 3 foot difference $=75$ points
- 4+ foot difference = 100 points
- Does NOT mean that project will be constructed to design standard



## HIGHWAY - [Paved] Shoulder Width

## Funding Category

Statewide Mobility
Regional Impact
Division Needs

## Criteria Weight

Purpose - Measure the existing paved shoulder width vs. DOT design standard

## Existing Paved Shoulder Width - DOT Design Standard Paved Shoulder Width

- Greater the difference, the higher points the project receives
- 1 foot difference = 25 points
- 2 foot difference $=50$ points
- 3 foot difference $=75$ points
- 4+ foot difference = 100 points
- Does NOT mean that project will be constructed to design standard



## HIGHWAY - Accessibility / Connectivity

## Funding Category

Statewide Mobility
Regional Impact
Division Needs

## Criteria Weight

## N/A

Purpose - Measure how to improve connections between rural areas and employment centers, tourist destinations, or military installations (connecting people and places)

3 options proposed:

1. Accessibility/Connectivity Index with rural areas defined as municipalities with population between 2,500 and 20,000 people
2. Accessibility/Connectivity Index with rural areas defined as municipalities with population between 1,500 and 20,000 people (new)
3. Evaluation of projects 20 minutes outside of employment centers (new)


## HIGHWAY - Accessibility/Connectivity (cont.)

Option 1 - Accessibility/Connectivity Index with rural areas defined as municipalities with population between 2,500 and 20,000 people

## Score based on Accessibility/Connectivity Index Map

- Activity Center and Census Block Groups with 5,000+ Jobs
- Activity Centers include cities over 20,000 people, military bases, ports, UNC campuses, trauma centers, top tourist destinations
- Rural Area (Rural Population Center) = Municipality with population between 2,500 and 20,000
- Map illustrates overlap of drive times from Activity Centers/Block Groups and Rural Population Centers



## HIGHWAY - Accessibility/Connectivity (cont.)

Option 2 - Accessibility/Connectivity Index with rural areas defined as municipalities with population between 1,500 and 20,000 people

## Score based on Accessibility/Connectivity Index Map

- Activity Center and Census Block Groups with 5,000+ Jobs
- Activity Centers includes cities over 20,000 people, military bases, ports, UNC campuses, trauma centers, top tourist destinations
- Rural Area (Rural Population Center) = Municipality with population between 1,500 and 20,000
- Map illustrates overlap of drive times from Activity Centers/Block Groups and Rural Population Centers
- New approach - not previously discussed with Workgroup



## HIGHWAY - Accessibility/Connectivity (cont.)

Option 3 - Evaluation of projects 20 minutes outside of employment centers
Score based on Existing Volume on eligible roadways $\rightarrow$ Volume/200

- Goal is to improve connections between rural areas and employment centers
- Employment centers defined as Census Block Groups with 2,500+ jobs
- Projects within 20 -minute drive time likely to score well based on other criteria
- Existing freeways are not eligible as they already provide a high level of connectivity
- New approach - not previously discussed with Workgroup



## Example Projects - Statewide Mobility Scores

| TIP | Project | $\begin{gathered} \text { Congestion } \\ (30 \%) \end{gathered}$ | [Travel Time] Benefit Cost (30\%) | Safety (10\%) | Econ. Comp. (10\%) | Multimodal <br> [\& Freight + Military] (20\%) | Total Quant. Score (100\%) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| R-2248E | I-485 New Location | 90.40 | 23.50 | 70.69 | 100.00 | 50.00 | 61.24 |
| I-4744 | I-40 Widening | 97.60 | 58.47 | 74.36 | 97.93 | 50.00 | 74.05 |
| R-2554BA | US 70 (Goldsboro Bypass) | 43.60 | 6.14 | 66.73 | 98.55 | 28.50 | 37.15 |
| R-4463B | NC 43 Connector | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- |
| R-2911B | US 70 Widening | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- |
| R-2519A | US 19E Widening | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| U-3810 | SR 1406 (Piney Green Rd) Widening | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- |
| U-4909 | SR 2643 (Union Cross Rd) Widening | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- |
| R-3833A | SR 1100 (Brawley School Rd) Widening | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- |



## Example Projects - Regional Impact Scores

| TIP | Project | Congestion (30\%) | [Travel Time] Benefit Cost (30\%) | Safety (10\%) | Total Quant. Score (70\%) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| R-2248E | I-485 New Location | 90.40 | 23.50 | 70.69 | 41.24 |
| 1-4744 | I-40 Widening | 97.60 | 58.47 | 74.36 | 54.26 |
| R-2554BA | US 70 (Goldsboro Bypass) | 43.60 | 6.14 | 66.73 | 21.59 |
| R-4463B | NC 43 Connector | 45.60 | 14.29 | 59.59 | 23.93 |
| R-2911B | US 70 Widening | 37.20 | 4.60 | 72.26 | 19.77 |
| R-2519A | US 19E Widening | 58.40 | 6.33 | 48.33 | 24.25 |
| U-3810 | SR 1406 (Piney Green Rd) Widening | -- | -- | -- | -- |
| U-4909 | SR 2643 (Union Cross Rd) Widening | -- | -- | -- | -- |
| R-3833A | SR 1100 (Brawley School Rd) Widening | -- | -- | -- | -- |



## Example Projects - Division Needs Scores

| TIP | Project | Congestion <br> (20\%) | [Travel Time] <br> Benefit Cost <br> $(\mathbf{2 0 \%})$ | Total <br> Safety <br> (10\%) | Quant. <br> Score <br> $\mathbf{( 5 0 \% )}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| R-2248E | I-485 New Location | 90.40 | 23.50 | 70.69 | $\mathbf{2 9 . 8 5}$ |
| I-4744 | I-40 Widening | 97.60 | 58.47 | 74.36 | $\mathbf{3 8 . 6 5}$ |
| R-2554BA | US 70 (Goldsboro Bypass) | 43.60 | 6.14 | 66.73 | $\mathbf{1 6 . 6 2}$ |
| R-4463B | NC 43 Connector | 45.60 | 14.29 | 59.59 | $\mathbf{1 7 . 9 4}$ |
| R-2911B | US 70 Widening | 37.20 | 4.60 | 72.26 | $\mathbf{1 5 . 5 9}$ |
| R-2519A | US 19E Widening | 58.40 | 6.33 | 48.33 | $\mathbf{1 7 . 7 8}$ |
| U-3810 | SR 1406 (Piney Green Rd) <br> Widening | 68.00 | 2.25 | 79.93 | $\mathbf{2 2 . 0 4}$ |
| U-4909 | SR 2643 (Union Cross Rd) <br> Widening | 66.40 | 0.90 | 76.53 | $\mathbf{2 1 . 1 1}$ |
| R-3833A | SR 1100 (Brawley School Rd) <br> Widening | 67.20 | 1.65 | 71.63 | $\mathbf{2 0 . 9 3}$ |

