

COMMISSION ON INDIGENT DEFENSE SERVICES
REPORT ON PUBLIC DEFENDER CONFLICTS
FOR FISCAL YEAR 2021-2022

SUBMITTED TO THE NORTH CAROLINA GENERAL ASSEMBLY
PURSUANT TO S.L. 2013-360, SECTION 18A.6.(B)
10 | 01 | 22

The Office of Indigent Defense Services shall report to the Chairs of the Joint Legislative Oversight Committee on Justice and Public Safety by October 1, 2013, and by October 1 of each year thereafter, on (i) the number of conflicts of interest that arose in public defender offices during the prior fiscal year and the cost to the State in private assigned counsel funds to resolve them and (ii) beginning with the October 1, 2014, report, the number of conflicts of interest resolved through the authorization in G.S. 7A-498.7(f1) during the prior fiscal year and the savings to the State in private assigned counsel funds as a result.

I. Relevant Legislative Provisions

This report is prepared pursuant to S.L. 360, § 18A.6.(b), which requires the North Carolina Office of Indigent Defense services to report annually on the following:

1. the number of conflicts of interest that arose in public defender offices during the prior fiscal year and the cost to the State in private assigned counsel funds to resolve them; and
2. the number of conflicts of interest resolved through the authorization in G.S. 7A-498.7(f1) during the prior fiscal year and the savings to the State in private assigned counsel funds as a result.

G.S. 498.7(f1), as amended by S.L. 360, § 18A.6.(a), directs that:

In cases in which a public defender determines that a conflict of interest exists in the office, whenever practical, rather than obtaining private assigned counsel to resolve the conflict, the public defender may request the appointment of an assistant public defender from another office of public defender in the region to resolve the conflict.

II. Ethical Obligations and Assignment Practices

A. Ethical Obligations

Public defender attorneys, like their private counterparts, are bound by the North Carolina State Bar's Rules of Professional Conduct (RPC) to avoid representing clients who have conflicts of interest with other current or former clients. Specifically, RPC 1.16(a)(1) requires an attorney to decline or to withdraw from representation if the representation will result in a violation of law or the Rules.

- RPC 1.7, Conflict of Interest: Current Clients, prohibits representation of a client if it will be directly adverse to another client, with certain limited exceptions.
- RPC 1.9, Duties to Former Clients, disallows representation of another person in the same or a substantially related matter in which the person's interests are materially adverse to the interests of a former client unless the former client provides a written waiver. Matters are substantially related if the lawyer learned of confidential information from the former client that can be used against the former client in the present matter or if facts relevant to the prior matter are relevant and material to present matter.
- RPC 1.10, Imputation of Conflicts of Interest, attributes to the attorney knowledge of any confidential information obtained through the office's prior representation and thus disqualification. If the office gained confidential information from both clients, the office will likely have to forgo representing each of them.

- RPC 1.1, Competence, requires, among other things, thoroughness and preparation for representation
- RPC 1.3, Diligence states in Comment 2 that “a lawyer’s work load must be controlled so that each matter can be handled competently.”

Conflicts and reassignments can also occur for other reasons, such as a breakdown in the attorney-client relationship. Another form of conflict of interest can occur when offices receive influxes of cases or have vacant positions, creating situations where the attorneys’ caseloads may exceed their capacity to adequately represent each client according to ethical standards.

B. Assignment Practices

All public defender offices in the state handle adult criminal cases in their respective districts, including misdemeanors, felonies, and probation violations and some offices also handle other cases in which indigent persons are entitled to counsel, such as abuse, neglect, dependency, and termination of parental rights.

Some offices are not staffed to handle and, therefore not expected to take all the non-conflict cases that arise in their jurisdictions. For example, Judicial District 10 was originally and is currently staffed to accommodate around half of the adult criminal cases in the district.

Depending on local preferences, some jurisdictions assign all cases the offices have agreed and are staffed to handle to public defender offices who may then reassign conflict cases to private counsel. In other districts, judges or clerks who spot evident conflicts will assign other counsel as the cases arise and will reassign cases upon request of the offices if conflicts become apparent after initial appointments have been made.

Offices also may reassign cases they might otherwise handle to private assigned counsel (PAC) because it is more efficient to do so. For example, if a defendant or respondent is represented by private counsel on other charges related or unrelated to the present matter, the office may assign the new matter to the same attorney to ensure that all matters are considered and resolved concurrently to the extent possible. An office may also do this if the defendant or respondent was represented by PAC in the past, taking advantage of an existing attorney client relationship and possible time saving in investigation. Additionally, sometimes offices will assign cases to PAC whose specialized knowledge or skills afford heightened ability to address certain complex matters.

Public defender offices did not typically cover each other’s conflict cases until G.S. 498.7(f1) was amended to require it when practicable. Instead, public defenders relied on local private counsel to fill in the gaps. This practice made sense because PAC already

practicing in the district were readily available and did incur further costs of travel. It also avoided inefficiencies created by handling a small number of cases in a county or district.

In contrast, district attorney offices have occasionally handled conflict cases from their peer offices; however, such instances are rare because district attorneys do not represent individual clients and thus do not face the same number of ethical conflicts. Furthermore, unlike public defender offices, district attorney offices do not maintain rosters of private prosecutors to whom they can easily transfer responsibilities for representation.

One exception to the general rule that North Carolina public defender offices have not historically covered each other's conflicts: the Gaston County and Mecklenburg County offices have a longstanding arrangement wherein the Gaston office employs an assistant public defender who is housed in the Mecklenburg office to handle some of the latter's felony conflict cases. This arrangement requires strict partition between the work product of that attorney and the rest of the Mecklenburg office, including dedicated support staff and firewalls for electronic data. This type of arrangement could be replicated in other offices, but it would work best in offices in proximity to each other, where the caseloads are sufficient to provide for full-time conflict work, and where resources allow for adequate sequestration.

C. Conflict Tracking

In October 2013, IDS revised its online disposition database to give public defender offices the ability to track conflicts and cases they assign out of their offices. Offices now enter by case type the number of cases they:

- reassign to PAC because of case-specific or workload conflicts, or other practical reasons; or
- transfer to other public defender offices.

It should be noted, however, that the offices often do not know when conflict assignments are made from the courtroom.

III. **FY 2021-22 Conflict of Interest and Assignments to Private Counsel**

A. Assignments to Private Counsel

In FY 2021-22, public defender offices reported a total of 40,155 cases reassigned to private counsel due to case conflicts, workload conflicts, and other non-conflict reasons. Specifically, offices reported:

- 15,123 case-specific conflict cases,
- 14,430 workload conflict cases, and
- 10,601 non-conflict cases.

Tables showing breakdowns of the numbers of cases assigned by type of case, court of jurisdiction at the time of assignment, and reason for reassignment can be found in Appendix A.

B. Assignments to Other Public Defender Offices

As shown in Appendix A, public defender offices transferred 83 conflict cases to other offices in FY 2021-22. However, all but two of those assignments were made by the Mecklenburg office to the Gaston conflict attorney position. The other two cases were from Forsyth County that were reassigned to the Guilford office because of a change of venue, which the Forsyth office determined to count as a conflict.

The only way to assess PAC equivalent costs for the Gaston conflict attorney position is to calculate them based on the position's disposed cases. In FY 2021-22, the Gaston conflict position closed 65 cases, including withdraws for two cases due to the position's own conflicts of interest. It is important to remember that the number cases disposed in fiscal year is not the same as the number of cases currently assigned to and being worked by the position.

If PAC had handled the Gaston conflict attorneys' 65 disposed cases in FY 2021-22, at the PAC hourly rates in effect at the time, it would have cost approximately \$29,167.38. Again, this calculation is based on statewide averages that may not be meaningfully applied to such a small number of cases. Because the personnel costs for the Gaston conflict attorneys exceeded that amount, no PAC savings were generated from this arrangement.

Because the specific cases the offices reassigned cannot be identified, conveying actual cost information is not possible. Further, although the offices tracked the type and class of each case, neither the ultimate court of jurisdiction at the time of disposition nor the method of disposition for the cases are known because the public defender offices do not have that information. As such, it would be very difficult to assess average costs for those cases absent further detail, in that a felony disposed in superior court typically involves more time and money than one that is resolved in district court; likewise, a disposition resulting from a jury trial is more time-consuming and costly than one resolved by a guilty plea or a dismissal.

In past years, interoffice transfers were used get coverage when local counsel was not available and not to provide cost efficiencies. Other than conflict units attached to offices, it is not clear that public defender offices' covering other offices' conflicts would be cost efficient. While there may be value in having public defender offices meet the needs of adjacent districts, having a public defender attorney travel to another district to handle one case might cost more than assigning local PAC.

It should be noted that, due to offices' variations in conflict data entry in previous years, which were addressed in FY 2017-18 to achieve standardization, it is not advisable to directly compare these numbers to those in reports prior to that time. Moreover, as offices have been added and expanded in the past few years, those offices' additional farm-outs would not have been included in previous years' totals. It should also be noted that the COVID-19 pandemic has led to changes in court procedures and case assignments since March 2020, and the effect of those changes on office conflicts and farm-outs is difficult to gauge at this point.

FARM-OUT COUNTS FOR ALL PUBLIC DEFENDER DISTRICTS
FY2021-22

Total All					
	Case Specific Conflict	Workload Conflict	Non-Conflict Farm-out	Transferred To Other PD Office	Total
	15123	14430	10601	83	40238

District Court Criminal					
	Case Specific Conflict	Workload Conflict	Non-Conflict Farm-out	Transferred To Other PD Office	Total
Felony A	4	1	0	0	5
Felony B1	67	45	14	0	126
Felony B2	65	23	16	0	104
Felony C	266	121	92	1	480
Felony D	448	135	160	5	748
Felony E	442	156	173	12	783
Felony F	389	207	189	4	789
Felony G	720	429	425	7	1581
Felony H	2458	1944	1828	37	6267
Felony I	1380	893	768	2	3043
Felony Prob Violation	33	114	140	0	287
Fugitive Extradition	19	97	73	1	190
DWI	280	1050	365	0	1695
Misd Non-Traffic	4869	5506	3903	11	14289
Class 3 Misd or Traff	717	1094	563	0	2374
Other Traffic	237	1007	110	0	1354
Criminal Contempt	3	4	0	0	7
Non-Felony Prob Viol	192	158	279	0	629
MAR	3	0	0	0	3
Other	7	1	18	0	26
Drug Trt Crt Session	1	0	0	0	1
Oth Spec Crt Session	1	2	1	0	4
Total	12601	12987	9117	80	34785

Superior Court Criminal					
	Case Specific Conflict	Workload Conflict	Non-Conflict Farm-out	Transferred To Other PD Office	Total
Felony A	4	2	3	0	9
Felony B1	23	10	8	0	41
Felony B2	22	4	11	0	37
Felony C	138	12	51	0	202
Felony D	146	27	55	2	230
Felony E	96	14	41	0	151
Felony F	94	27	49	0	170
Felony G	168	50	124	0	342
Felony H	340	119	222	1	682
Felony I	157	33	49	0	239
Fel Prob Violation	556	370	419	0	1345
DWI Appeal	4	1	7	0	12
Misd Appeal, Non-traf	59	6	21	0	86
Class 3 Misd/Traf Appl	15	1	2	0	18
Other Traffic Appeal	15	3	1	0	19
Criminal Contempt	0	0	0	0	0
Civil Contempt Other	0	0	1	0	1
Competency	0	0	0	0	0
Involuntary Committ	0	0	0	0	0
Non-Felony Prob Viol	12	93	27	0	132
MAR	0	0	0	0	0
Term Sex Off Reg	5	1	0	0	6
Satellite Monitoring	0	0	2	0	2
Other	4	0	1	0	5
Drug Trt Crt Session	0	0	0	0	0
Oth Spc Crt Session	0	0	0	0	0
Total	1858	773	1094	3	3729

District Court Juvenile					
	Case Specific Conflict	Workload Conflict	Non-Conflict Farm-out	Transferred To Other PD Office	Total
Felony A	5	1	0	0	6
Felony B1	1	0	1	0	2
Felony B2	0	1	0	0	1
Felony C	5	1	0	0	6
Felony D	17	3	22	0	42
Felony E	5	0	5	0	10
Felony F	1	1	3	0	5
Felony G	7	5	14	0	26
Felony H	31	68	98	0	197
Felony I	19	32	15	0	66
Misdemeanor	95	98	93	0	286
Civil Contempt Other	0	0	0	0	0
Motion for Review	18	0	113	0	131
Subsequent Review	0	0	0	0	0
Other	39	0	0	0	39
Drug Trt Crt Session	0	0	0	0	0
Drug Trt Crt Final Disp	1	0	0	0	1
Total	244	210	364	0	818

District Court Civil					
	Case Specific Conflict	Workload Conflict	Non-Conflict Farm-out	Transferred To Other PD Office	Total
A/N/D Adjud	300	199	3	0	502
A/N/D Review	7	0	0	0	7
Term Parental Rights	68	0	13	0	81
Child Supp Contempt	19	1	0	0	20
Civil Contempt Other	0	0	0	0	0
Invol Commit, Adult	8	260	10	0	278
Invol Commit, Juv	0	0	0	0	0
Competency	13	0	0	0	13
Other	5	0	0	0	5
Drug Trt Crt Session	0	0	0	0	0
Oth Spec Crt Session	0	0	0	0	0
Total	420	460	26	0	906

CURRENT HOURLY ASSIGNED COUNSEL RATES

January 1, 2022

Case Type^{1, 2}	Effective Date for Current Rate³	Current Rate
Superior Court Division		
LWOP and potentially LWOP	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$100
Class B1-D felony	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$85
Satellite-based monitoring “bring back” hearings	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$85
Reviews of NGRI determinations	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$85
Non-capital post-conviction where the most serious conviction was a Class A-D felony	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$85
Class E-I felony or felony probation violation	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$65
All other cases resolved in Superior Court	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$65
District Court Division		
Non-potentially capital Class A-D felony	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$85
Driving While Impaired	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$65
Class A1 misdemeanor	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$65
Class E-I felony or felony probation violation	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$65
Civil cases – child support contempt, civil contempt, and involuntary commitment proceedings	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$65
Civil cases – abuse, neglect, dependency, termination of parental rights,	Hearing completed on or after January 1, 2022	\$65
All other cases resolved in District Court	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$65
Capital Cases		
Provisional counsel	Work done on or after January 1, 2022	\$85
Potentially capital cases proceeding non-capitally (cases declared non-capital at Rule 24 hearing or by the DA, or cases that are 1 or more years from warrant served date)	Work done on or after January 1, 2022	\$100
Potentially capital cases (undesignated cases within 1 year of warrant served date)	Work done on or after January 1, 2022	\$100
Capital cases (cases declared capital at a Rule 24 hearing)	Work done on or after January 1, 2022	\$100
Capital direct appeals and post-conviction	Work done on or after January 1, 2022	\$100
Appellate Division		
LWOP and juvenile life with parole	Work done on or after January 1, 2022	\$100
Class B1-D felony appeals and appeals of satellite-based monitoring hearings	Work done on or after January 1, 2022	\$85
Non-criminal and all other criminal appeals	Work done on or after January 1, 2022	\$75
Capital appeals	Work done on or after January 1, 2022	\$100
Hearings Before Post-Release Supervision or Parole Commissions or Clerk of Court		
Parole and post-release supervision revocation hearings	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$65
Competency proceedings pursuant to Chapter 35A	Final disposition on or after January 1, 2022	\$65

¹ Applicable rate is based on the highest charge against the defendant or juvenile.

² Unless otherwise specified, rates for the juvenile division of district and superior courts are the same as the equivalent charge against an adult defendant.

³ Fee applications where the current rate is effective at “Final disposition on or after Jan. 1, 2022” (see column 2) will be paid at a single rate; this means that for those cases the current rate applies to all work performed, including work prior to January 1, 2022.

APPENDIX B

Private Assigned Counsel Average Hours Claimed per Case by Case Type and Year Case Disposed: Superior Court is Non-Trial Only, District and Other Case Types Include Non-Trial and Trials (PAC Data through 11/8/2012. Excludes Flat Fee and Attorney-for-the-day Case Types Even If Paid at Hourly Rate)

		FY05				FY10					FY11					FY12					Cost		Hours	
		No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Min.	Max.	No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Med. Hrs	Min.	Max.	No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Med. Hrs	Min.	Max.	No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Med. Hrs	Min.	Max.	% Change in Cost Due to Hrs FY10 to FY11	% Change in Cost Due to Hrs FY10 to FY12	% Change in Hrs FY10 to FY11	% Change in Hrs FY10 to FY12
Sup. Court	Felony Class Unknown					28	8.84	5.00	2.00	76.52	31	13.03	7.00	2.00	139.20	14	9.93	9.00	2.00	19.50	52.6%	5.5%	47.3%	12.3%
	Class A Felony	9	41.70	16.00	552.00	47	51.72	40.20	1.50	199.60	26	51.30	33.45	3.00	281.75	27	59.02	28.30	2.20	199.75	0.0%	12.8%	-0.8%	14.1%
	Class B1 Felony	118	19.60	4.00	235.00																			
	Class B2 Felony	37	21.80	4.00	150.00																			
	Class B1 or B2 Felony					540	24.13	16.00	1.00	222.20	519	24.29	16.00	2.00	142.60	524	26.56	17.95	1.60	421.30	0.7%	9.2%	0.7%	10.1%
	Class C Felony	325	14.70	1.00	100.00	1,447	15.26	10.80	.65	180.40	1,507	15.03	11.00	.60	126.00	1,386	15.30	11.00	.60	190.50	-1.4%	-0.8%	-1.5%	0.3%
	Class D Felony	352	13.40	2.00	169.00	1,534	13.26	10.00	1.50	113.55	1,343	14.29	11.00	1.00	118.15	1,256	14.42	11.00	1.00	161.50	6.7%	6.1%	7.7%	8.8%
	Class E Felony	173	10.00	2.00	66.00	848	10.52	8.00	1.00	84.00	848	11.96	9.00	1.00	120.10	833	12.69	10.00	1.00	85.00	13.6%	20.0%	13.7%	20.6%
	Class F Felony	248	10.20	1.00	163.00	1,185	10.03	8.00	1.00	82.50	1,320	10.30	8.00	1.00	97.50	1,404	10.47	8.50	.90	89.40	3.0%	4.6%	2.7%	4.4%
	Class G Felony	464	8.30	1.00	126.00	2,433	8.91	7.40	.60	57.25	2,430	9.30	7.60	.50	187.00	2,164	9.71	8.00	.80	110.50	4.5%	7.5%	4.4%	9.0%
	Class H Felony	1,954	7.00	1.00	67.00	7,741	7.51	6.00	.50	107.25	7,977	7.91	6.75	.50	73.25	7,683	8.24	7.00	.50	65.70	5.6%	9.0%	5.3%	9.7%
	Class I Felony	849	6.30	1.00	153.00	2,957	6.64	5.75	.85	110.00	2,972	6.97	6.00	0.75	100.00	2,635	7.59	6.10	.50	148.75	5.1%	12.2%	4.9%	14.3%
	Felony PV	4,258	3.20	1.00	23.80	5,368	3.10	2.60	.50	53.90	5,650	3.13	2.80	.40	25.20	5,126	3.18	3.00	.30	40.00	0.6%	1.7%	0.7%	2.6%
	DWI	359	7.20	1.00	65.00	204	6.64	5.33	1.00	30.00	267	7.56	5.20	1.00	186.25	226	7.58	6.00	1.00	51.50	19.7%	15.0%	13.9%	14.3%
	Misd. Non-traffic	1,333	5.80	1.00	42.80	1,151	5.31	4.00	.50	55.00	1,179	5.73	4.70	.50	45.20	1,141	5.99	5.00	.50	40.50	8.1%	11.7%	7.8%	12.7%
	Misd. Traffic (non-DWI)	415	4.40	1.00	21.00	411	4.53	4.00	1.00	46.00	379	4.56	4.00	.50	18.30	395	5.09	4.10	.50	33.25	0.6%	11.0%	0.6%	12.4%
	Criminal Contempt					24	3.77	3.00	1.00	9.50	37	4.62	4.00	1.00	18.25	29	4.50	3.40	1.00	17.25	35.3%	20.3%	22.5%	19.2%
	Misd. PV	1,063	3.30	1.00	26.50	1,277	3.12	2.80	.20	15.80	1,354	3.28	3.00	.50	23.50	1,192	3.46	3.00	.40	18.20	5.8%	9.4%	5.2%	11.0%
	Satellite-based monitoring					2	6.00	6.00	3.00	9.00	20	7.99	6.03	2.25	26.80	72	4.47	3.00	1.00	43.50	335.8%	-913.9%	33.1%	-25.6%
	Other--Criminal					156	6.91	4.00	.50	138.70	116	4.83	3.00	.60	27.25	115	4.45	3.25	.50	28.60	-22.4%	-26.8%	-30.1%	-35.6%
	Unknown/Not Entered															2	3.05	3.05	2.00	4.10	0.0%	0.0%		
	Total	11,957		1.00	552.00	27,353	7.66	5.60	.20	222.20	27,975	7.86	6.00	.40	281.75	26,224	8.26	6.00	.30	421.30	2.3%	6.4%	2.6%	7.8%
Dist. Court	Felony Class Unknown					67	4.79	4.00	1.00	33.60	43	3.78	3.50	1.00	10.00	25	5.37	4.00	1.00	26.75	-13.6%	4.3%	-21.1%	12.1%
	Class A Felony					21	11.21	4.00	1.00	50.00	17	19.80	5.70	2.00	85.50	7	10.91	4.00	1.50	34.70	64.5%	-1.5%	76.6%	-2.7%
	Class B1 or B2 Felony					102	11.58	8.00	1.00	64.91	87	10.26	7.00	1.00	65.00	63	9.94	6.70	1.00	66.75	-10.1%	-10.9%	-11.4%	-14.2%
	Class C Felony					325	7.02	5.00	.50	42.30	323	7.48	5.00	.75	71.50	307	8.01	5.30	.50	88.00	6.5%	7.7%	6.5%	14.1%
	Class D Felony					451	5.95	4.60	.50	49.00	413	6.64	4.90	.40	116.00	407	6.10	5.00	.50	69.00	10.7%	-3.6%	11.6%	2.5%
	Class E Felony					483	5.36	4.20	.90	68.50	521	5.57	4.10	.50	50.80	504	5.62	4.50	1.00	50.00	4.3%	4.7%	3.9%	4.8%
	Class F Felony					521	5.30	4.00	.60	79.25	508	5.27	4.50	.50	43.75	547	5.87	4.50	.80	72.09	-0.6%	11.5%	-0.5%	10.6%
	Class G Felony					830	4.81	4.00	.50	36.00	908	4.96	4.00	.50	29.00	871	5.47	4.25	.50	80.00	3.3%	13.8%	3.1%	13.6%
	Class H Felony					7,517	4.24	4.00	.30	50.50	7,548	4.43	4.00	.20	48.00	7,793	4.63	4.00	.10	30.75	4.5%	9.3%	4.5%	9.2%
	Class I Felony					3,248	4.00	3.50	.50	44.02	3,233	4.23	4.00	.25	36.40	3,027	4.46	4.00	.25	33.35	5.6%	10.6%	5.6%	11.4%
	Felony PV		3.00	.10	16.00	388	2.80	2.50	.50	14.00	425	2.79	2.40	.25	11.40	442	3.06	2.90	.50	17.00	0.2%	12.2%	-0.4%	9.1%
	DWI		3.70	.10	25.00	7,686	4.16	3.80	.25	65.80	7,803	4.41	4.00	.40	49.25	6,851	4.86	4.00	.10	50.00	6.0%	14.6%	5.9%	16.8%
	Misd. Non-traffic		3.00	.10	52.00	53,550	3.04	2.80	.10	50.50	55,082	3.12	3.00	.15	39.50	52,919	3.31	3.00	.20	46.50	2.5%	8.1%	2.4%	8.7%
	Misd. Traffic (non-DWI)		2.90	.10	16.00	15,840	2.89	2.60	.20	27.75	17,647	2.93	2.70	.08	38.00	16,331	3.16	3.00	.20	69.40	1.8%	8.8%	1.5%	9.2%
	Criminal Contempt					233	2.41	2.00	.25	10.00	272	2.76	2.20	.50	16.70	252	2.81	2.20	.10	22.70	17.3%	17.4%	14.4%	16.4%
	Misd. PV		2.60	.10	17.60	6,120	2.65	2.25	.25	18.50	6,574	2.70	2.20	.20	26.50	6,458	2.78	2.50	.10	18.00	2.1%	4.7%	1.9%	4.9%
	Other--Criminal					836	2.80	2.25	.20	22.19	882	3.00	2.50	.33	24.40	856	3.24	2.75	.30	37.60	7.8%	14.9%	7.2%	15.7%
	Unknown/Not Entered					1	1.50	1.50	1.50	1.50	7	17.66	18.80	1.00	39.90	6	10.63	9.85	2.10	21.50	7621.9%	3746.4%	1077.1%	608.3%
	Total	66,303		0.10	52.00	98,219	3.28	3.00	.10	79.25	102,293	3.36	3.00	.08	116.00	97,666	3.57	3.00	.10	88.00	2.8%	8.3%	2.6%	9.0%

Private Assigned Counsel Average Hours Claimed per Case by Case Type and Year Case Disposed: Superior Court is Non-Trial Only, District and Other Case Types Include Non-Trial and Trials
(PAC Data through 11/8/2012. Excludes Flat Fee and Attorney-for-the-day Case Types Even If Paid at Hourly Rate)

		FY05				FY10					FY11					FY12					Cost		Hours	
		No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Min.	Max.	No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Med. Hrs	Min.	Max.	No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Med. Hrs	Min.	Max.	No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Med. Hrs	Min.	Max.	% Change in Cost Due to Hrs FY10 to FY11	% Change in Cost Due to Hrs FY10 to FY12	% Change in Hrs FY10 to FY11	% Change in Hrs FY10 to FY12
Adult Crim.	Felony Class Unknown					95	5.99	4.25	1.00	76.52	74	7.65	4.50	1.00	139.20	39	7.01	5.00	1.00	26.75	24.1%	6.9%	27.9%	17.0%
	Class A Felony					68	39.21	27.50	1.00	199.60	43	38.85	22.75	2.00	281.75	34	49.11	25.00	1.50	199.75	0.2%	16.8%	-0.9%	25.2%
	Class B1 or B2 Felony					642	22.13	15.00	1.00	222.20	606	22.28	15.00	1.00	142.60	587	24.78	16.50	1.00	421.30	0.6%	10.2%	0.6%	11.9%
	Class C Felony					1,772	13.75	10.00	.50	180.40	1,830	13.70	10.00	.60	126.00	1,693	13.98	10.00	.50	190.50	-0.3%	0.1%	-0.4%	1.7%
	Class D Felony					1,985	11.60	9.00	.50	113.55	1,756	12.49	9.33	.40	118.15	1,663	12.39	9.00	.50	161.50	6.7%	4.0%	7.6%	6.8%
	Class E Felony					1,331	8.65	7.00	.90	84.00	1,369	9.53	7.00	.50	120.10	1,337	10.02	7.50	1.00	85.00	10.4%	15.9%	10.2%	15.9%
	Class F Felony					1,706	8.58	6.50	.60	82.50	1,828	8.90	7.00	.50	97.50	1,951	9.18	7.00	.80	89.40	4.2%	7.6%	3.7%	7.0%
	Class G Felony					3,263	7.87	6.25	.50	57.25	3,338	8.12	6.40	.50	187.00	3,035	8.49	7.00	.50	110.50	3.3%	6.7%	3.3%	8.0%
	Class H Felony					15,258	5.90	5.00	.30	107.25	15,525	6.22	5.00	.20	73.25	15,476	6.42	5.00	.10	65.70	5.6%	8.4%	5.4%	8.8%
	Class I Felony					6,205	5.26	4.20	.50	110.00	6,205	5.54	4.75	.25	100.00	5,662	5.92	5.00	.25	148.75	5.4%	11.0%	5.3%	12.5%
	Felony PV					5,756	3.08	2.50	.50	53.90	6,075	3.10	2.75	.25	25.20	5,568	3.17	3.00	.30	40.00	0.6%	2.1%	0.6%	2.9%
	DWI					7,890	4.23	3.91	.25	65.80	8,070	4.51	4.00	.40	186.25	7,077	4.95	4.00	.10	51.50	7.1%	15.0%	6.7%	17.1%
	Misd. Non-traffic					54,701	3.09	2.90	.10	55.00	56,261	3.17	3.00	.15	45.20	54,060	3.36	3.00	.20	46.50	2.8%	8.3%	2.6%	8.8%
	Misd. Traffic (non-DWI)					16,251	2.93	2.70	.20	46.00	18,026	2.97	2.70	.08	38.00	16,726	3.20	3.00	.20	69.40	1.4%	8.8%	1.2%	9.2%
	Criminal Contempt					257	2.54	2.00	.25	10.00	309	2.98	2.42	.50	18.25	281	2.98	2.35	.10	22.70	22.1%	18.6%	17.5%	17.4%
	Misd. PV					7,397	2.73	2.40	.20	18.50	7,928	2.80	2.30	.20	26.50	7,650	2.88	2.50	.10	18.20	2.8%	5.2%	2.5%	5.6%
	Satellite-based monitoring					2	6.00	6.00	3.00	9.00	20	7.99	6.03	2.25	26.80	72	4.47	3.00	1.00	43.50	335.8%	-913.9%	33.1%	-25.6%
	Other--Criminal					992	3.45	2.50	.20	138.70	998	3.22	2.50	.33	27.25	971	3.39	2.90	.30	37.60	-7.8%	-4.1%	-6.7%	-1.8%
	Unknown/Not Entered					1	1.50	1.50	1.50	1.50	7	17.66	18.80	1.00	39.90	8	8.73	3.90	2.00	21.50	7621.9%	3990.0%	1077.1%	482.1%
	Total	78,260		0.10	552	125,572	4.23	3.00	.10	222.20	130,268	4.33	3.00	.08	281.75	123,890	4.56	3.45	.10	421.30	2.2%	6.8%	2.3%	7.8%
Civil	AND					19,174	5.76	3.90	0.00	179.00	19,216	6.23	4.00	0.00	244.75	15,807	6.10	4.00	0.00	235.80	8.3%	6.3%	8.3%	6.0%
	TPR					953	10.28	6.00	0.00	107.00	1,019	9.91	5.55	0.00	136.00	759	9.65	6.00	.20	89.50	-3.6%	-4.1%	-3.5%	-6.1%
	Child Support Contempt	3	0.1	30.6		12,774	2.83	2.25	.01	40.00	12,668	2.99	2.50	0.00	54.50	13,110	3.09	2.50	0.00	54.90	5.3%	10.1%	5.6%	9.0%
	Other Civil Contempt					243	4.81	4.00	.20	41.25	339	4.71	3.50	.50	54.47	201	5.23	4.00	1.00	49.70	-3.5%	5.5%	-2.1%	8.7%
	Invol. Commitment					2,984	1.37	1.00	0.00	40.00	3,572	1.34	1.00	.05	17.37	3,691	1.31	1.00	0.00	28.50	-3.4%	-6.6%	-2.3%	-5.0%
	Competency					2,956	4.43	3.25	0.00	95.30	3,507	4.64	3.50	0.00	84.50	3,479	5.00	3.75	0.00	61.60	4.9%	15.8%	4.8%	12.9%
	Other--Civil					184	3.16	2.23	.40	32.30	235	3.48	2.10	.32	46.25	109	3.79	2.40	.50	58.70	20.8%	18.3%	10.0%	20.0%
	Total					39,268	4.46	3.00	0.00	179.00	40,556	4.72	3.00	0.00	244.75	37,156	4.52	3.00	0.00	235.80	5.7%	2.3%	5.8%	1.3%
Juv.	Felony Class Unknown					29	5.92	5.00	.50	30.00	6	7.88	4.50	1.55	27.85	14	3.73	3.00	1.00	12.00	6.5%	-18.4%	33.1%	-37.0%
	Class A Felony					8	21.42	9.60	0.00	59.00	10	47.27	31.70	1.60	120.60	7	36.60	42.50	2.05	85.50	56.7%	10.0%	120.7%	70.9%
	Class B1 or B2 Felony					70	14.44	8.00	1.00	117.25	75	12.59	8.00	1.10	49.30	90	11.73	8.00	1.00	91.00	-13.4%	-26.8%	-12.9%	-18.8%
	Class C Felony					58	9.95	7.30	.70	51.90	59	10.00	7.50	.50	45.60	49	11.34	8.50	2.00	35.30	-2.4%	8.7%	0.5%	14.0%
	Class D Felony					86	9.14	6.88	1.22	46.50	84	13.98	8.60	2.25	83.20	101	10.06	8.00	1.00	37.40	51.3%	6.7%	53.0%	10.1%
	Class E Felony					38	5.79	4.30	1.00	34.90	49	10.20	6.91	1.70	63.50	28	10.33	6.60	1.60	29.75	97.2%	54.7%	76.1%	78.3%
	Class F Felony					62	6.80	4.75	1.00	40.00	65	7.98	7.00	2.00	28.75	62	5.94	4.50	1.60	26.50	18.5%	-13.4%	17.5%	-12.5%
	Class G Felony					117	6.56	5.00	.50	72.00	107	6.57	5.00	1.00	31.90	104	6.37	5.10	.70	31.00	-0.2%	-3.1%	0.2%	-2.9%
	Class H Felony					888	5.26	4.20	.14	33.10	811	5.27	4.10	.60	38.50	759	5.49	4.30	.50	42.00	-0.5%	2.2%	0.0%	4.2%
	Class I Felony					335	4.76	4.00	.25	36.90	284	5.10	4.00	.50	25.90	290	5.42	4.00	1.00	67.80	5.6%	10.5%	7.0%	13.8%
	Misd. Non-traffic					4,061	3.45	3.00	.20	69.00	3,754	3.55	3.00	.04	61.50	3,677	3.63	3.00	.06	41.75	2.8%	3.7%	2.9%	5.4%
	Juvenile Delinquency					9	3.97	1.60	.70	20.50	4	2.98	2.95	2.00	4.00	1	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	-11.2%	-8.3%	-25.0%	-74.8%
	Motion for Review--PV					1,655	2.61	2.00	.05	22.25	1,564	2.65	2.00	.08	32.40	1,344	2.63	2.00	.25	22.10	1.3%	-0.2%	1.5%	0.6%
	Motion for Review--Other					679	2.12	1.80	.30	17.00	618	2.13	2.00	0.00	14.25	463	2.33	2.00	.20	13.30	0.5%	6.1%	0.4%	9.8%
	Status Review					205	2.16	1.75	.20	11.00	242	2.12	1.70	.30	16.40	136	2.10	1.73	.40	12.70	-2.6%	-2.8%	-1.7%	-2.7%
	Detention Hearing					36	1.82	1.70	.25	4.00	39	1.73	1.50	.50	5.75	20	2.22	2.05	.50	5.00	-6.0%	11.6%	-4.7%	22.0%
	Undisciplined (Contempt)					324	2.79	2.28	.40	33.90	218	2.76	2.25	.25	22.50	157	2.51	2.00	.35	9.50	1.6%	-4.0%	-1.1%	-9.8%
	Satellite-based monitoring															3	4.50	3.50	2.00	8.00	0.0%	0.0%		
	Competency					8	2.51	2.00	1.00	5.00	13	3.71	2.00	1.00	12.00	7	4.53	5.00	1.50	7.35	77.3%	72.1%	47.6%	80.2%
	Other--Criminal					398	3.13	2.00	.20	25.60	348	3.17	2.25	.30	27.00	374	2.90	2.00	0.00	35.40	1.0%	-7.8%	1.4%	-7.3%
	Unknown/Not Entered										4	7.75	7.50	4.00	12.00	2	4.50	4.50	2.00	7.00	0.0%	0.0%		
	Total					9,066	3.63	2.90	0.00	117.25	8,354	3.81	3.00	0.00	120.60	7,688	3.88	3.00	0.00	91.00	4.9%	4.9%	5.1%	7.0%

Private Assigned Counsel Average Hours Claimed per Case by Case Type and Year Case Disposed: Superior Court is Non-Trial Only, District and Other Case Types Include Non-Trial and Trials
(PAC Data through 11/8/2012. Excludes Flat Fee and Attorney-for-the-day Case Types Even If Paid at Hourly Rate)

		FY05				FY10					FY11					FY12					Cost		Hours	
		No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Min.	Max.	No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Med. Hrs	Min.	Max.	No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Med. Hrs	Min.	Max.	No. Fee Apps	Avg. Hrs	Med. Hrs	Min.	Max.	% Change in Cost Due to Hrs FY10 to FY11	% Change in Cost Due to Hrs FY10 to FY12	% Change in Hrs FY10 to FY11	% Change in Hrs FY10 to FY12
GAL	AND					2,339	5.30	3.60	0.00	105.15	2,509	5.50	3.50	0.00	77.40	1,995	5.27	3.75	.20	129.80	3.9%	0.4%	3.9%	-0.4%
	TPR					171	8.82	5.00	.40	78.80	152	8.37	5.70	1.00	75.30	128	9.93	6.00	2.00	129.70	-4.6%	10.5%	-5.0%	12.6%
	Competency					379	4.48	3.40	0.00	29.71	36	5.94	4.70	1.00	22.00	10	3.56	2.50	1.00	10.25	3.1%	-0.6%	32.6%	-20.7%
	GAL										2	13.00	13.00	.50	25.50						0.0%	0.0%		
	Other--Civil					163	4.26	3.35	.50	29.50	163	4.89	4.00	.70	37.67	136	5.11	4.00	0.00	20.00	15.7%	15.6%	14.6%	19.9%
	Unknown/Not Entered					1	1.60	1.60	1.60	1.60	1	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00						481.9%	-100.0%		
	Total					3,053	5.34	3.70	0.00	105.15	2,863	5.63	3.70	0.00	77.40	2,269	5.52	3.90	0.00	129.80	4.9%	3.1%	5.5%	3.4%
Total	Felony Class Unknown					124	5.97	4.50	.50	76.52	80	7.67	4.50	1.00	139.20	53	6.14	4.50	1.00	26.75	20.5%	1.1%	28.5%	2.9%
	Class A Felony					76	37.34	25.60	0.00	199.60	53	40.44	22.75	1.60	281.75	41	46.98	25.00	1.50	199.75	4.1%	15.6%	8.3%	25.8%
	Class B1 or B2 Felony					712	21.38	14.50	1.00	222.20	681	21.21	14.30	1.00	142.60	677	23.04	15.00	1.00	421.30	-0.7%	6.6%	-0.8%	7.8%
	Class C Felony					1,830	13.63	9.75	.50	180.40	1,889	13.58	10.00	.50	126.00	1,742	13.91	10.00	.50	190.50	-0.3%	0.4%	-0.4%	2.1%
	Class D Felony					2,071	11.50	9.00	.50	113.55	1,840	12.56	9.10	.40	118.15	1,764	12.25	9.00	.50	161.50	8.1%	3.8%	9.2%	6.6%
	Class E Felony					1,369	8.57	7.00	.90	84.00	1,418	9.55	7.00	.50	120.10	1,365	10.03	7.50	1.00	85.00	11.7%	16.8%	11.5%	17.1%
	Class F Felony					1,768	8.52	6.50	.60	82.50	1,893	8.87	7.00	.50	97.50	2,013	9.08	7.00	.80	89.40	4.6%	7.1%	4.1%	6.6%
	Class G Felony					3,380	7.82	6.00	.50	72.00	3,445	8.07	6.25	.50	187.00	3,139	8.42	7.00	.50	110.50	3.3%	6.4%	3.2%	7.7%
	Class H Felony					16,146	5.86	5.00	.14	107.25	16,336	6.17	5.00	.20	73.25	16,235	6.38	5.00	.10	65.70	5.4%	8.3%	5.2%	8.8%
	Class I Felony					6,540	5.24	4.20	.25	110.00	6,489	5.52	4.70	.25	100.00	5,952	5.89	5.00	.25	148.75	5.5%	11.0%	5.5%	12.6%
	Felony PV					5,756	3.08	2.50	.50	53.90	6,075	3.10	2.75	.25	25.20	5,568	3.17	3.00	.30	40.00	0.6%	2.1%	0.6%	2.9%
	DWI					7,890	4.23	3.91	.25	65.80	8,070	4.51	4.00	.40	186.25	7,077	4.95	4.00	.10	51.50	7.1%	15.0%	6.7%	17.1%
	Misd. Non-traffic					58,762	3.12	2.90	.10	69.00	60,015	3.19	3.00	.04	61.50	57,737	3.38	3.00	.06	46.50	2.7%	7.9%	2.5%	8.5%
	Juvenile Delinquency					9	3.97	1.60	.70	20.50	4	2.98	2.95	2.00	4.00	1	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	-11.2%	-8.3%	-25.0%	-74.8%
	Misd. Traffic (non-DWI)					16,251	2.93	2.70	.20	46.00	18,026	2.97	2.70	.08	38.00	16,726	3.20	3.00	.20	69.40	1.4%	8.8%	1.2%	9.2%
	Criminal Contempt					257	2.54	2.00	.25	10.00	309	2.98	2.42	.50	18.25	281	2.98	2.35	.10	22.70	22.1%	18.6%	17.5%	17.4%
	Misd. PV					7,397	2.73	2.40	.20	18.50	7,928	2.80	2.30	.20	26.50	7,650	2.88	2.50	.10	18.20	2.8%	5.2%	2.5%	5.6%
	Motion for Review--PV					1,655	2.61	2.00	.05	22.25	1,564	2.65	2.00	.08	32.40	1,344	2.63	2.00	.25	22.10	1.3%	-0.2%	1.5%	0.6%
	Motion for Review--Other					679	2.12	1.80	.30	17.00	618	2.13	2.00	0.00	14.25	463	2.33	2.00	.20	13.30	0.5%	6.1%	0.4%	9.8%
	Status Review					205	2.16	1.75	.20	11.00	242	2.12	1.70	.30	16.40	136	2.10	1.73	.40	12.70	-2.6%	-2.8%	-1.7%	-2.7%
	Detention Hearing					36	1.82	1.70	.25	4.00	39	1.73	1.50	.50	5.75	20	2.22	2.05	.50	5.00	-6.0%	11.6%	-4.7%	22.0%
	Undisciplined (Contempt)					324	2.79	2.28	.40	33.90	218	2.76	2.25	.25	22.50	157	2.51	2.00	.35	9.50	1.6%	-4.0%	-1.1%	-9.8%
	Satellite-based monitoring					2	6.00	6.00	3.00	9.00	20	7.99	6.03	2.25	26.80	75	4.47	3.00	1.00	43.50	335.8%	-956.9%	33.1%	-25.6%
	AND					21,513	5.71	3.85	0.00	179.00	21,725	6.15	4.00	0.00	244.75	17,802	6.01	4.00	0.00	235.80	7.8%	5.7%	7.7%	5.3%
	TPR					1,124	10.05	5.80	0.00	107.00	1,171	9.71	5.55	0.00	136.00	887	9.69	6.00	.20	129.70	-3.4%	-2.1%	-3.4%	-3.6%
	Child Support Contempt					12,774	2.83	2.25	.01	40.00	12,668	2.99	2.50	0.00	54.50	13,110	3.09	2.50	0.00	54.90	5.3%	10.1%	5.6%	9.0%
	Other Civil Contempt					243	4.81	4.00	.20	41.25	339	4.71	3.50	.50	54.47	201	5.23	4.00	1.00	49.70	-3.5%	5.5%	-2.1%	8.7%
	Invol. Commitment					2,984	1.37	1.00	0.00	40.00	3,572	1.34	1.00	.05	17.37	3,691	1.31	1.00	0.00	28.50	-3.4%	-6.6%	-2.3%	-5.0%
	Competency					3,343	4.43	3.30	0.00	95.30	3,556	4.65	3.50	0.00	84.50	3,496	5.00	3.78	0.00	61.60	4.5%	13.8%	4.9%	12.7%
	GAL										2	13.00	13.00	.50	25.50						0.0%	0.0%		
	Other--Civil					347	3.68	2.90	.40	32.30	398	4.05	2.78	.32	46.25	245	4.52	3.60	0.00	58.70	15.4%	19.0%	10.2%	23.0%
	Other--Criminal					1,390	3.36	2.50	.20	138.70	1,346	3.21	2.50	.30	27.25	1,345	3.25	2.60	0.00	37.60	-5.2%	-5.0%	-4.5%	-3.2%
	Unknown/Not Entered					2	1.55	1.55	1.50	1.60	12	12.88	11.00	0.00	39.90	10	7.89	3.90	2.00	21.50	4727.1%	2108.1%	731.2%	408.7%
	Total					176,959	4.27	3.00	0.00	222.20	182,041	4.41	3.00	0.00	281.75	171,003	4.54	3.25	0.00	421.30	3.2%	5.7%	3.3%	6.3%
Interims have been combined with final fee applications wherever possible. Excludes withdrawals and unmatched or open case interim fee applications.																								
Felony A cases include non-capital trial level cases only. Source: NC Office of Indigent Defense Services, Research Department, 12-6-12.																								